|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| DAVID Y. IGE GOVERNOR  Ke Kiaʻāina | **A picture containing logo  Description automatically generated** | AUDREY HIDANO COMPTROLLER  Ka Luna Hoʻomalu Hana Laulā  **MEOH-LENG SILLIMAN**  DEPUTY COMPTROLLER  Ka Hope Luna Hoʻomalu Hana Laulā |
|  | **STATE OF HAWAII**  **Communications, Technical, and Finance Meeting**  **Thursday, November 10, 2022**  **9:00 am – 12:00 pm** |  |

**MEETING MINUTES**

**Communications Committee Members Present:** Thalia Burns (HPD)

**Communications Committee Members Not Present:** Davlynn Racadio (MPD) Chair, Lavina Taovao (KPD)

**Technical Committee Members Present:** Shawn Kuratani (HFD) Chair, Tony Ramirez (Akimeka), Tony Velasco (DIT), Thalia Burns (HPD), Kenison Tejada (First Net)

**Technical Committee Members Not Present:** David Miyasaki (KPD)

**Finance Committee Members Present:** Lisa Hiraoka (Consumer Advocate Designee), Todd Omura (CIO Designee), Aaron Farias (HIPD)

**Finance Committee Members Not Present:** Edward Fujioka (EMS)

**Staff:** Courtney Tagupa (E911), Royce Murakami (E911), Stella Kam (AG)

**Guests:** Francis Alueta (HT), Stephen Courtney (C&C of Honolulu), Frannie Chung (EMS), Diana Chung (EMS), Stacy Domingo (EMS), Wayne Hirasa (Alakaina), Everett Kaneshige (DOD), E. Kalani Ke (KPD), Glenn Kobashigawa (HT), Kurt Lager (OSL), Patrick Leddy (LCC), Kimberly Lee (HPD), Rebecca Lieberman (Charter), Reed Mahuna (HIPD), Lorrin Okumura (EMS), Stacy Perreira (KPD), Jeff Reeve (ATT), Corey Shaffer (Verizon), Valerie Taylor (Intrado), Kenison Tejada (First Net), Keola Tom (MPD), Ruth Zipfel (Eagle View), Diana Culverhouse (Central Square), Julie Heimkes (Winbourne).

1. Call to Order, Public Notice

**The meeting was called to order by the Chair. Public notice was given.**

1. Public Testimony Will Be Taken on All Agenda Items as Those Items Occur During the Meeting
2. Roll Call, Quorum

**A roll call was taken, quorum was met for all committees except the Communications Committee.**

1. Review and Approval of September’s Meeting Minutes

**Tony Ramirez motioned to approve the September 2022 Meeting Minutes. Francis Alueta seconded the motion. A voice vote was taken, and the motion was approved unanimously.**

1. Review and Approval of October’s Meeting Minutes

**Corey Shaffer motioned to approve the October 2022 Meeting Minutes. Rebecca Lieberman seconded the motion. A voice vote was taken, and the motion was approved unanimously.**

1. Committee Updates by Committee Chairs
   1. Communications Committee – Davlynn Racadio
      1. No Updates to Report

**Davlynn Racadio is not present. Notified Administrative Assistant that there are no updates for the Communications Committee currently.**

* 1. Technical Committee – Shawn Kuratani
     1. Increase of ANI/ALI (Automatic Number Identification / Automatic Location Identification) From 10 to 20 Characters to Improve Descriptions for Dispatchable Locations for First Responders.

**Shawn Kuratani stated that Corey Shaffer notified the Technical Committee that currently Hawaii PSAP’s are currently using 10 characters in the location field for 911 ALI/ANI information from Intrado. He also added that the NENA standard for this field currently is set to 20 characters and new networks called ERAN (Elastic Radio Access Networks) need to leverage this field to get the most accurate location information.**

**Shawn Kuratani stated that a discussion was held on this topic during the monthly PSAP meeting that was facilitated by Tony Ramirez (Akimeka) and Glenn Kobashigawa (Hawaiian Telcom) with representatives from Intrado. During the discussion it was stated that the change from 10 to 20 characters can be done with minimal to no cost however, all counties will need to make the switch if one decides to make the change. Furthermore, that all equipment and items that use ALI information downstream such as MDT and CAD must be configured before this change takes place. Shawn Kuratani stated that he believes that the counties that were present during the discussion for the PSAPs all want to move forward with the change. He added that he will follow up with Glenn Kobashigawa for more information on the cost and scheduling that needs to be down through coordination with Hawaiian Telcom and Intrado.**

* + 1. Discussion on Transition to Next Generation 911 to include Next Steps and Request for Proposal

**Shawn Kuratani stated that the Technical Subcommittee met on October 4th to have members review the Winbourne’ s Deliverables and RFP. After reviewing both documents the Technical Subcommittee wanted clarification on whether Hawaiian Telcom has sole authority to provide all 911 services because if this statement is true there would be no need to contract a vendor to draft an RFP. He added that after reviewing Winbourne’ s Deliverables there was conflicting information stating that Hawaiian Telcom believes their operation authority as a carrier of last resort gives them sole authority to offer 911 services to Hawaii. Furthermore, in the same Deliverable it also states that Hawaiian Telcom’s ability to leverage existing certificate of convenience and necessity as a carrier of last resort to be the sole provider of 911 services within the state of Hawaii is still undergoing legal review of this option. To gain more clarification on this information Shawn Kuratani stated that they reached out to Stella Kam to have her reach out to Hawaiian Telcom for further clarification. During this discussion Hawaiian Telcom stated that they do not have exclusivity however the Winbourne Deliverable states otherwise but does not document the source of the statement. Shawn Kuratani stated that he would like to ask the Board whether to move forward or conduct more research on this topic.**

**Thalia Burns stated in previous discussions it was to her understanding that all agencies wanted to move forward with using Hawaiian Telcom. Shawn Kuratani responded that the consensus for Hawaiian Telcom to provide the services of NG 9-1-1 as a portion and for the PSAPs to choose their own vendor. He added as far as complete services Hawaiian Telcom may be responsible for the ESI Net portion but as far as next generation core services that could be provided by another vendor. The issue that the Technical Subcommittee wanted clarification on is if Hawaiian Telcom was exclusivity rights because than there would be no need to procure another vendor. Francis Alueta responded stating that Hawaiian Telcom’s understanding via the tariff is that they do have the obligation for 911 services. However, the differentiation stated by Winbourne which they do not disagree with is that from a NG 9-1-1 perspective the PUC does not have and jurisdiction over nonregulated IP services. Stella Kam responded that the tariff states that Hawaiian Telcom has the right to provide 911 services however, regarding next generation services it does not state that another entity is prohibited. She added that the entity must file to be a provider of telecom communications in the State of Hawaii. Francis Alueta responded stating that if the Board decides to move forward with procuring an RFP Hawaiian Telcom will have no objections and consider going through the RFP process. Corey Shaffer added that there are different layers with NG 9-1-1 however, regarding the transport network which could still be utilized by Hawaiian Telcom which is a telecom provider he noted that a topic that should be consider is if there is any requirement that an IP service be provided by a company that is a registered telecom provider. He added that he believes that it is not a separate service because IMS services allow you to gain and separate all these capabilities by separating higher layers. Furthermore, stated that he believes Hawaiian Telcom can be used to physically connect while adding the IP layer on top of the existing system which is currently being implemented with the use of Rapid SOS. Rapid SOS is not a registered telecom company in Hawaii however, it is an existing IP service on top of the existing network. In conclusion, Corey Shaffer stated that NG 9-1-1 calls are delivered via IP and even though it is not being currently implemented by Hawaiian Telcom it will be in the future and will not be regulate by the PUC.**

**Shawn Kuratani asked the Board for its stance on this matter. He stated that his concern was he did not want the Technical Subcommittee to continue their research to procure a vendor to provide NG 9-1-1 services if Hawaiian Telcom was exclusivity as a provider for 911 services for the State of Hawaii. Corey Shaffer responded from his experience witnessing this occur several times in the last 20 years in the industry is that these IP services are always unregulated and can be separated from the transport network. He added that the call delivery voiceover IP call functions can all be separated and are not the same as landline services and they cannot be regulated by the PUC. Furthermore, stated that the legalities will not transfer over to the IP space from his experience on what has occurred in the telecom industry. Thalia Burns stated that the board has the authority to tell the PSAPs how to proceed however, she stated that this is the PSAPs decision on which direction they want to proceed. She added that it was her understanding that the agencies already determined how they wanted to proceed but perhaps this topic needs to be revisited again. Shawn Kuratani responded that the agencies decided that Hawaiian Telcom providing all the services could be one of the options however, another option is for Hawaiian Telcom to provide some of the services and as Corey Shaffer stated to procure other vendors to reduce cost. He added that he wants to have approval to have the option and not having Hawaiian Telcom intervening stating that they are responsible for choosing the vendor. Francis Alueta stated on behalf of Hawaiian Telcom that they will not intervene legally. He added that they do not have an issue based on some internal discussions alone with feedback from outside counsel. In conclusion, he stated that if the Board decides to move forward with an RFP they will not intervene. Lisa Hiraoka responded to the Board if this needs to be put in writing or is a verbal approval sufficient. Stella Kam responded stating that from her understanding it is not the Board that will be doing the solicitation and the selection of the vendor it will be each PSAP. She added that even though we have Francis Alueta’s verbal statement that Hawaiian Telcom will not intervene stating that they can only be the successful offeror for the RFP. Furthermore, stated that she believes that the counties must decide to move forward on their own knowing that this has been the system that the tariff is allowing or authorizing Hawaiian Telcom to provide the current 911 services and that there is a difference between IP and how the calls are delivered. Also, that she believes that anything is needed from Hawaiian Telcom because it is not the Board that will be procuring the RFP.**

**Everett Kaneshige stated that if Hawaiian Telcom or anyone wanted to raise an issue that type of issue would be raised through the procurement process. If the process to procure an RFP reaches a point to where each county, choose to push through procurement and encounters a vendor who has a concern with the RFP or wants to change the language and so forth. However, other NG 9-1-1 systems in other jurisdictions such as California and Massachusetts are not going through the local utility regulation process. Kenison Tejada responded stated that he believes it is important for the PSAPs or the ECCs is that they have the support from the Board if any complicated problems arose that would need legal opinion and the possibility of funding. Lisa Hiraoka responded stating that if he is notifying the Board that they need to be mindful that they could be responsible for legal bills or anything regarding a challenge to the process on behalf of the PSAPs. Kenison Tejada responded stating that he wants the Board to be prepared if the PSAP’s ask the Board for assistance. Corey Shaffer responded stating that the Technical Subcommittee have done exceptional research and the Board will continue to support any questions that they may have and regarding Stella Kam’s point the decisions are with the PSAPs on how they wish to proceed. The question is now is if the counties are comfortable moving forward based on the discussions in this meeting that historically IP services are unregulated and that Hawaiian Telcom has stated that they have no interest in intervening in this process. In conclusion, he stated that the Board will always be there to support all the agencies however, the ultimate decision is with the PSAPs. Furthermore, after the discussion during this meeting he believes that it is very low risk to proceed, and they will be able to choose the option they wish. Stella Kam responded stating that the counties are advised by their corporation council and so to that extent she noted that they may reach out to her to have discussions however, she stated that she will not be representing the counties. She added that as Corey Shaffer stated that the Board is a resource for the PSAPs for guidance however it is now up to the agencies to decide how they will make their solicitations and selections. In conclusion, she stated that it may be safer to change the language in the statue to recognize the term Enhanced 911 will include all future technologies in preparation of Next Generation 9-1-1. Currently no administrative package bill was introduced however, if we could contact a legislator to introduce a bill to expand the definition or to create a definition so that the Board is able to fund these future technologies.**

**Francis Alueta stated to other board members as part of the recommendation from Winbourne was that we have a statewide NG 9-1-1 platform however, if the PSAPs decide to move forward with the procurement process how do we prevent ourselves from having multiple solutions. He added as stated by Winbourne a possible solution would be to give the Board the ability to procure however, this would require a change in the charter. Corey Shaffer responded stating that this was discussed by the counties with Winbourne that they would all benefit mutually by selecting one vendor for scalability and compatibility. Francis Alueta responded stating that he has no further questions. Shawn Kuratani responded stating that he will take all the comments from this discussion to the Technical Subcommittee and believes that they will be more confident moving forward based on the comments stated by Francis Alueta.**

**Shawn Kuratani stated the Technical Subcommittee met on October 11th the with Tony Ramirez for his presentation on the transition from Enhanced 911 to NG 9-1-1. He stated that the presentation explained possible components that can be managed by outside vendors as well as Hawaiian Telcom. He added that he highly recommends the Board to view the presentation because it gives a thorough explanation of the transition at an understandable level.**

**Stella Kam stated that she would like to add to the discussion on a possible solution to have all counties to have one contact with a provider. She stated that a cooperative purchasing solicitation could be a solution that would allow one county to take the lead that would begin the solicitation process after approval from the State Procurement Office. The selection committee could include county representative from each county that would ask permission from the State Procurement Office to be included in this cooperative purchasing group. Shawn Kuratani responded stating that he will investigate that option.**

* + 1. Discussion to add (National Emergency Number Association) NENA Standards & Best Practices Conference to Future Conferences

**Shawn Kuratani stated that he was invited to attend this conference by Glenn Kobashigawa and feels that it would be beneficial for members of the Technical Subcommittee to attend to gain a better understanding of the guidelines and RFP process. He stated that he wanted to present this to the Board as a possible future conference to attend. Thalia Burns stated that some of the agencies already attend this conference and is tailored more for personnel in managerial level positions. Shawn Kuratani responded stating that he would like pre-approval for four members of the Technical Subcommittee to attend the conference.**

**Thalia Burns asked for a motion to amend the agenda to include approval of four members of the Technical Subcommittee to attend the NENA Standards & Best Practices Conference in Clearwater Florida on January 17th to the 19th at a limit of $3500 per person in expenditures. Corey Shaffer motioned to approve four members from the Technical Subcommittee to attend the conference. Tony Ramirez seconded the motion. A voice vote was taken the motion was unanimously approved. This request will be moved to the Finance Committee for approval.**

* + 1. Reimbursement Request Hawaii Police Department
       1. Approval of Pre-Conference Course for Reed Mahuna and additional expenditures for APCO (Association of Public-Safety Communications Officials) Conference Total of $590.92

**Reed Mahuna stated that HIPD is making this request due to attending a cyber security course one day prior to the conference. He stated that he apologizes and should have got pre-approval from the Board.**

**Shawn Kuratani asked for a motion to amend the agenda to include approval of pre-conference course for Reed Mahuna and additional expenditures for APCO Conference total of $590.92. Tony Ramirez motioned to approve the request from HIPD. Tony Velasco seconded the motion. A voice vote was taken the motion was unanimously approved. This request will be moved to the Finance Committee for approval.**

* 1. Educational Investigative Committee – (Chair of Educational Investigative Committee Undecided)
     1. No Updates to Report
  2. Advisory Committee – Everett Kaneshige
     1. Update on Meeting with Representative Nakamura and/or Other Legislators

**Everett Kaneshige stated that there were no changes to the presentation or spreadsheet that was presented to the Board last month. Furthermore, added that they will proceed with contacting Representative Nakamura and any other legislators that she recommends or may be interested in seeing the presentation and discussing the reclassification.**

* 1. Finance Committee – Lisa Hiraoka
     1. Review of Monthly Y-T-D (Year to Date) Cash Flow

**Lisa Hiraoka stated that she will be reviewing the Y-T-D Cash Flow Statement.**

**Receipts: $1,042,523**

**Disbursements: ($472,114)**

**Net Receipts/ (Disbursements): $570,409**

**Net Bank Balance: $34,388,783**

**Outstanding Encumbrances/Accruals: ($11,293,706)**

**Unencumbered Cash Balance: $23,095,077**

**Lisa Hiraoka stated that she has asked the Executive Director to discuss the encumbrance balances for 2015-2017 in next month’s meeting. She added that the Executive Director should be reaching out to those with outstanding encumbrances to resolve them and work on following years to clear those encumbrances to increase the cash balance for the Board.**

* + 1. Approval to add (National Emergency Number Association) NENA Standards & Best Practices Conference to Future Conferences

**Lisa Hiraoka stated that she would like a motion to approve four members of the Technical Subcommittee to attend the NENA Standards & Best Practices Conference for a total of $14,000 at $3500 per person. Todd Omura motioned to approve the request by Shawn Kuratani and the Technical Subcommittee. Aaron Farias seconded the motion. A voice vote was taken the motion was unanimously approved.**

* + 1. Reimbursement Request Hawaii Police Department
       1. Approval of Pre-Conference Course for Reed Mahuna and additional expenditures for APCO (Association of Public Safety Communications Officials) Conference Total of $590.92

**Lisa Hiraoka stated that she would like a motion to approve Hawaii Police Departments request for approval of pre-conference course for Reed Mahuna for the APCO Conference total of $590.92. Aaron Farias motioned to approve the request from Hawaii Police Department. Todd Omura seconded the motion. A voice vote was taken, and the motion was unanimously approved.**

**Lisa Hiraoka stated to all PSAP’s for future conferences to include all pre-conference courses to avoid these types of problems in the future.**

1. Public Service Answering Point Status Updates on Recruitment and other Personnel Issues
   1. Kauai Police Department – Stacy Perreira
      1. Update on Recruitment Process/Strategies and Personnel Training

**Stacy Perreira stated that they currently have one personnel that will complete their training at the end of November and will be having a police officer that will be assigned to them for about 30 days that will be primarily handling call taking at this time. Furthermore, stated that they will be having their last dispatcher starting the APCO PST Course I on November 16th.**

* + 1. Update on Personnel Issues and Vacancies

**Stacy Perreira stated that there will be two vacancies at the end of November due to one dispatcher retiring.**

**Elliot Kalani Ke stated that Stacy Perreira will be promoted to the rank of Lieutenant effective December 4th and will not be attending any future meetings. Furthermore, will be assigned to the Patrol Bureau and will be filling her vacancy with a new Sergeant that will begin training soon and be assigned to the PSAP section.**

* 1. Oahu Police Department – Aaron Farias
     1. Update on Recruitment Process/Strategies and Personnel Training

**Aaron Farias stated for their PCO & ERO positions they conducted interviews for their Police Communications Officer IV for promotion. Currently waiting on the results as well as notifications that were sent out to 18 candidates for four positions pending review from their Human Resources Division.**

* + 1. Update on Personnel Issues and Vacancies

**Aaron Farias stated that there are currently three new Emergency Response Operators that will begin training on November 16th as well as another Police Communications Officer. He added that there Communications staffing is on par with the rest of the department which is running at about 32% vacancy. Regarding civilian members vacancy is at about 28% which is a less than department wide however, they are still actively recruiting.**

* 1. Oahu Fire Department – Shawn Kuratani
     1. Update on Recruitment Process/Strategies and Personnel Training

**Shawn Kuratani stated that there are currently no updates at this time.**

* + 1. Update on Personnel Issues and Vacancies

**Shawn Kuratani stated that there are currently no vacancies to report.**

* 1. Oahu Emergency Medical Services – Lorrin Okumura, Diana Chun, Frannie Chung
     1. Update on Recruitment Process/Strategies and Personnel Training

**Lorrin Okumura stated that there are currently no updates at this time.**

* + 1. Update on Personnel Issues and Vacancies

**Lorrin Okumura stated that they currently filled one position with a permanent position however, unfortunately the position was taken by a contract EMT apart of the Reliever section. Furthermore, are in the process of filling another EMD Class as well as a Reliever Dispatchers and their staffing section.**

* 1. Maui Police Department – Davlynn Racadio
     1. Update on Recruitment Process/Strategies and Personnel Training

**Davlynn Racadio currently not present to give update.**

* + 1. Update on Personnel Issues and Vacancies

**Davlynn Racadio currently not present to give update.**

* 1. Molokai Police Department – Davlynn Racadio
     1. Update on Recruitment Process/Strategies and Personnel Training

**Davlynn Racadio currently not present to give update.**

* + 1. Update on Personnel Issues and Vacancies

**Davlynn Racadio currently not present to give update.**

* 1. Hawaii Police Department – Robert Fujitake
     1. Update on Recruitment Process/Strategies and Personnel Training

**Reed Mahuna stated that there are currently no updates at this time.**

* + 1. Update on Personnel Issues and Vacancies

**Reed Mahuna speaking on behalf of Robert Fujitake stated that they currently have 5 PCO I personnel that will begin call takes training on November 16th. Unfortunately, one of the PCO I resigned after becoming overwhelmed during training on October 31st. In conclusion, he stated that they have interviewed 3 PCO I applicants and will look to recommend one for hire however, still conducting continuous recruitment for the PCO 1.**

* 1. Hawaii Fire Department – Vern Hara
     1. Update on Recruitment Process/Strategies and Personnel Training

**Stacy Domingo stated that the remaining personnel in training they are hoping to streamline training, so it does not take a year to complete. Furthermore, they are planning to start another class early next year with another recruitment.**

* + 1. Update on Personnel Issues and Vacancies

**Stacy Domingo speaking on behalf of Vern Hara stated that there are currently 9 vacancies for their positions and have started training for four new personnel, however, are only down to one personnel currently in training.**

1. Items for Discussion, Consideration, and Action
   1. 911 Timeline Update (Akimeka)
      1. Status Reports on All Counties
   2. Additional Items Proposed by Meeting Attendees

**No additional items proposed by meeting attendees.**

1. Announcements
   1. Future Virtual Meeting Dates/Times (9:00AM-12:00PM)
      1. Thursday, December 8, 2022 (Combined Meeting)
   2. Future Conference Dates (3 Months of Advanced Approval Required)
      1. 911 GTW (Goes to Washington) Conference, February 26-March 1, 2023, Arlington, VA
      2. Pictometry/EagleView, April 24-27th, San Antonio, TX
   3. Additional Announcements from Meeting Attendees

**Thalia Burns speaking on behalf of Davlynn Racadio stated regarding 911 GTW Conference that all agencies send Davlynn Racadio a list of attendees so that she can begin planning for the conference.**

1. Open Forum: Public comment on issues not on the Committee Meeting Agenda

**There was no public comment on issues not on the agenda.**

1. Adjournment

**Lisa Hiraoka motioned to adjourn the meeting. Tony Ramirez seconded the motion. A voice vote was taken, and the adjournment was unanimously approved. The meeting was adjourned.**